

terre des hommes Deutschland e. V.  
Ruppenkampstraße 11a  
49084 Osnabrück  
Lena Niehaus  
Referat Kofinanzierung

19.03.2019

## **Stellungnahme zur externen Halbzeitevaluierung des Projektes**

Projekt-Nr.: 1303  
Projektbezeichnung: HEAL II - Ökologische Kinderrechte durch Schutz des Ökosystems Küste, Anpassung an den Klimawandel und Umweltbildung im Distrikt Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu, Indien.  
Evaluiertes Zeitraum: März 2016 – Oktober 2018  
EvaluatorenInnen: Varghese T.A., Kalpana Sathish

Die Evaluierung des Projektes „HEAL II - Ökologische Kinderrechte durch Schutz des Ökosystems Küste, Anpassung an den Klimawandel und Umweltbildung im Distrikt Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu, Indien“ evaluierte das Projekt anhand der DAC-Kriterien und prüfte, wo das Projekt hinsichtlich der im Projektantrag formulierten Unterziele, der geplanten Qualität und des geplanten Zeitrahmens steht, und ob eventuell Planvorgaben zu präzisieren sind.

Der Evaluierungsprozess ist reibungslos verlaufen und führte zu positiven Ergebnissen und hilfreichen Empfehlungen, die die EvaluatorenInnen zum Abschluss der Evaluierung mit den Akteuren vor Ort diskutierten. terre des hommes teilt die Einschätzungen der EvaluatorenInnen.

In einer vom Projektträger durchgeführten Auswertungssitzung der Evaluierungsergebnisse entstand die folgende Stellungnahme zu den Empfehlungen der Evaluierung und ein Aktionsplan, der darlegt, wie diese umgesetzt werden sollen. Die Umsetzung dieser Planung wurde vom terre des hommes-Büro in Tamil Nadu, Indien im Rahmen seines Monitorings begleitet und über das Berichtswesen in der Geschäftsstelle nachgehalten.

Osnabrück, den 19.03.2019

Lena Niehaus

Referentin Kofinanzierung

	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Assessment by tdh and partner</b>	<b>Timeline and responsible</b>
	<p><b>8.1.1. Appropriateness of Project Design and Monitoring Systems</b></p> <p>Cross learning among the Partner NGOs may be strengthened further to enhance efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of the processes, results and relations established in the Project.</p> <p>Impact/result focus linking activity &gt; goal and output &gt; impact – may be established clearly and effectively to monitor and understand (evaluate) impacts of the Project.</p>	<p>The three partner organizations have already been meeting once in three months for a review meeting. From November onwards, it will be ensured that the three teams come together more frequently to share their learning, experience and plan the way forward. The participation in networks, the initiatives taken in advocacy and lobbying and the good practices by each organization in ensuring sustainability will be shared during the meetings.</p> <p>The impact / result chain will be made clearer and in detail during the preparation of the bi-annual report.</p>	<p>From the month of November, 2018. The Directors of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust.</p> <p>Jan, 2019. Administration Manager</p>
	<p><b>8.1.2. Target s - Planned Vs. Actual</b></p> <p>Remaining gaps in outputs may be addressed in the Project period.</p>	<p>As mentioned in the evaluation report almost all the planned targets and more than the proposed outputs have been achieved in many activities. A few of the activities with regard to waste management units and plant clarification system have also been completed as on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2018.</p>	<p>The Directors of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust.</p>
	<p><b>8.1.3. Efficiency</b></p> <p>Postponed activities may be completed during the project period (based on findings and recommendations relating to specific sectors presented below).</p> <p>Partner NGOs may be supported to sustain the services of the Project team (especially community level workers, young volunteers) beyond the project period.</p> <p>Partner NGOs may re-assess the capacities, identify the capacity gaps and capacitate the Project team immediately (particularly in impact monitoring, identifying and documenting key learnings,</p>	<p>All the postponed activities have been completed as on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2018.</p> <p>The project activities will be sustained beyond the project period as they have been implemented in collaboration with the local institutions like the Panchayat, women self-help groups and fishermen groups. In the final year of the project most of the activities had been implemented with the Basic Christian Communities, Panchayat and the Community Council in the lead and these are some of the strong grassroots community groups in the coastal region. Thus, it will be ensured that the activities would be sustained even after the completion of the project.</p> <p>The project team had been capacitated in themes of child right to participation, child protection, policies and legislations on child rights during the project period and the recommended capacity building training on</p>	<p>The Administrative Manager and Specialist Documentation for the capacity building on monitoring for the staff team by 31<sup>st</sup> January 2019 and the Administrative Manager for the best practices document completion (print and video) by February 2019.</p>

	<p>and best practices of the project).</p>	<p>monitoring and documenting. The “Specialist Documentation” will provide key learnings by the end of January 2019 for the staff team of all three organization. By the end of February 2019 a best practices document (print and video documentation) on the project will be completed.</p>	
	<p><b>8.1.4. Effectiveness</b></p> <p>Important gaps – including new activities required to improve effectiveness and making changes in some activities – may be addressed to further enhance effectiveness of the Project.</p>	<p>All the proposed activities will be completed within this project phase. All necessary steps are taken to fill the gaps within the scope of the project proposal.</p>	<p>The directors of all three organizations.</p>
	<p><b>8.1.5. Equity</b></p> <p>Any needy target groups/persons, excluded from activities (voluntarily or involuntarily), in a location/community may be identified and their participation ensured, in consultation with the local institutions, in the remaining period of the Project. Systems for sharing costs and benefits of the community based facilities – ponds, wells, eco-farms, child action centres – equitably, particularly for the ex-Project period (sustainability) may be developed and applied in consultation with the target groups.</p>	<p>From the perspective of the local project holder, there have been no major target groups/persons excluded from the activities and if so it has been only on the basis of prioritization and inclusion of the most marginalized community members. However, before the completion of the project a consultation will be held with the community members to identify and integrate all the target groups. A final sustainability review will be done in all the villages and report submitted.</p>	<p>Animators, Community Workers under the leadership of project coordinators of each organization will be responsible and the sustainability report submitted with the approval of directors by February 2019.</p>
	<p><b>8.1.6. Sustainability</b></p> <p>Local groups/institutions associating with the Project may be supported to develop and put into practice their strategies of sustaining the processes and results of the Project. Partner NGOs may formulate their own plans, with clear strategies, for sustaining the</p>	<p>As per the recommendations, a consultation with the government agencies and a staff review meeting will be held in January 2019. Based on these discussions and consultation the three implementing organizations arrive at a consensus on the strategies for sustaining the results of the project. These strategies are shared with the community sustainability mechanisms like water user committee, waste management committee and women groups as</p>	<p>The Directors of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust will be responsible. Consultation with Government agencies and staff review will be done by January 2019 and meetings with the community</p>

	<p>processes and results of the Project. Support of government agencies may be sought and obtained for further strengthening and up-scaling the activities.</p>	<p>well as the Panchayat and community council by February 2019.</p>	<p>sustainability mechanisms will be done by February 2019.</p>
	<p><b><u>8.2. Sector Specific Recommendations</u></b></p>		
	<p><b>8.2.1. Reduction of Contamination – Waste Management</b></p>		
	<p>The Program may be reformulated based on study/experiences of other innovative and effective waste management programmes of other parts of the country/world. Following generally accepted principles may be adopted: (1) waste reduction – also making available degradable materials like cloth bags for storage/transportation; (2) segregation of waste source; (3) conversion of degradable waste at source (into manure, gas etc.); (4) collection, transportation and storage of only non-degradable wastes; (5) recyclable non-degradable waste may be recycled using environmentally sound practices, with the support of government, research institutions and private sector, and (6) non-recyclable waste may be managed with the support of local government officials and private sector. Dumping degradable and non-degradable wastes together into central yards and segregation, with a time lag, may be avoided.</p>	<p>Sensitization on the segregation of waste materials at source has already started during the waste management committee meetings in October 2018. In many of the villages, especially in those where the school garden have been established, integration of waste management and food security has already started. The vermin compost from the waste management units have been distributed to the organic models farms and schools garden. Introducing of new components like vegetable grow bags and terrace gardening may be difficult as the project is nearing completion. The waste management committees are expected to share their good practices in schools and other educational institution with the handholding support of the implementing organizations in the future.</p> <p>As part of this process, the women workers in the Waste Management System have approached the District Collector with petitions for providing them with toilet facilities and a shed for taking rest in the waste management unit in Chinnathurai village. The District Administration has promised to support.</p> <p>The representatives of HEAL participated in the SEED Replicator Workshop held in Mumbai on Nov. 27<sup>th</sup>, 2018 and plans have been drafted to adopt some of the best practices in waste management in the intervention villages.</p>	<p>The staff team of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust. From October, 2018 to February 2019 review of the good practices in waste segregation by other organizations and introducing it to the waste management committee. And follow up and handholding support to the sustainability groups continued beyond the project period.</p>

<p>Integration of waste management with safe food production needs to be strengthened. Manure from degradable wastes may be used to enhance safe crop production in a more systematic manner, focusing on food/nutritional security of the coastal people, especially children. Appropriate practices like using grow bags for vegetable cultivation in the small homesteads of coastal areas may be introduced. (Terrace of buildings and courtyards may also be used for growing plants in the bags to improve their food availability/nutrition status). Participation of more families and non-family entities – institutions, markets, shops, hotels, industrial units, hospitals, etc. – and sustainability (financial, institutional, and technical) may be ensured to enhance impact. Waste management should be by all (no exclusion) in a given locality.</p> <p>Experience of the small pilot intervention – plant clarification system – in the coir processing areas, to prevent pollution of water and soil, may be studied for wider application.</p>	<p>The study on the impact of the plant clarification system will be taken up after a year or two through local fundraising.</p>	
<p><b>8.2.2. Food Security – Clean and Nutritious Food:</b></p>		
<p><u>8.2.2.1. Eco Model Farms</u></p> <p>Sustainability of the eco-model farms may be examined; appropriate strategies may be adopted to continue the farms beyond the project period. Association of farmers adopting eco-farming practices</p>	<p>The eco model farms will continue even after the completion of the project as the farm managers and the farm owners have a good level of motivation and interest to continue with the development of the farm and training of farmers and sharing resources initiatives. The three teams have started exploring the possibility for collaboration with national and international agencies / institutions in</p>	<p>Association of the trained farmers formed and formalized by February 2019 and the responsibility of which is taken by the farm managers with</p>

<p>may be formed and strengthened to promote, continue and strengthen cross-learning, sharing of resources and collective actions in production, processing, branding and marketing of organically grown products. Collaboration with national and international agencies/institutions – Tamil Nadu Agriculture University, Networks of Eco-Farmers, IFOAM etc for example – may be initiated and strengthened.</p>	<p>sustainable agriculture and the results of which will be shared in the final report.</p>	<p>the support of the project coordinators.</p>
<p><b>8.2.2.2. School Eco-Gardens (with more focus on vegetables and fruit crops)</b> Sustainability of the school gardens may be formulated – together with the school authorities – to continue the gardens beyond the Project period. Other educational institutions including colleges may be encouraged to establish eco-gardens with more focus on food crops (vegetables, fruit trees).</p>	<p>The sustainability of the schools gardens has been ensured as all the school authorities have promised to manage the school garden, rainwater-harvesting system as well as continue the eco clubs in schools. Efforts have been taken to promote organic model garden in colleges like Scott Christian college and other colleges in Nagercoil.</p>	<p>Report on the sustainability of the schools garden to be submitted by February 2019.</p>
<p><b>8.2.3. Water Security – Open Wells, Ponds and Rainwater Harvesting Units</b> Sustainability (institutional, technical and financial) of water management system of the wells and ponds may be formulated. (Also involve further strengthen the user groups, linking them with the local government agencies, and introducing systems for maintenance, operation and sharing of the costs and benefits by the user groups). Project experiences – processes, results, lessons –</p>	<p>The water management system has already been made sustainable with the strengthening of the water user’s committee and for the past two years, the committee is in charge of the management of the restored water resources. The good practices document will be prepared before the completion of the project and shared with local bodies like Panchayat, District Administration and other state &amp; national platforms of civil society organizations.</p>	<p>Documentation of good practices on water resource management will be part of the good practices document to be prepared by February 2019.</p>

<p>may be studied and documented; and the documents may be shared for wider application elsewhere. Government agencies – particularly Panchayats – may be influenced for developing other natural water sources and introducing rainwater harvesting systems in other parts of the district to improve water security of the people. (Kanyakumari district has large number of natural water bodies).</p>		
<p><b>8.2.2.4. Manakudy Eco-System</b></p> <p>HEAL may be supported to continue its active involvement and constructive collaboration with the approved Government programmes in Manakudy eco system to ensure community participation, equity, effectiveness and efficiency.</p> <p>Experiences of the Project in developing/protecting the Eco-system may be documented and shared widely (as protection of fragile eco-system is an important global/national concern).</p> <p>Pollution in the Pazhayar river (watershed) system, particularly from the urban areas of Nagercoil, may be addressed, using appropriate strategies as part of protecting the Manakudy Eco –system.</p>	<p>HEAL will be continuing the constructive collaboration with the Department of Fisheries and the Ministry of Tourism for the implementation of the Government programmes in Manakudy eco system. Since the Government project has already been sanctioned and the Director of HEAL is in the advisory board it is expected the collaboration will continue.</p> <p>The experience of the project in developing and protecting the eco system will be part of the good practices document to be submitted by February 2019.</p> <p>It would be difficult to address the pollution in the Pazhayar river as it is a new component and within the limited time period available. Necessary interventions cannot be formulated. However, as the members of the Government advisory board HEAL would initiate dialogues with the Government Departments to address the pollution in water sources in Nagercoil.</p>	<p>HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust will be responsible and it will be a continued process even after the completion of the project.</p>
<p><b>8.2.2.5 Income/Livelihood Security</b></p> <p>Partner NGOs may support the local institutions (SHGs, Parish</p>	<p>There has been a substantial increase in the income levels of the women who were supported with the livelihood equipment. The access to government development schemes had been another good practice in terms of</p>	<p>The staff team of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust will be responsible and activities to be taken</p>

<p>Committees etc.) to formulate effective livelihood strategies for the most marginalized families – women-headed, families with aged and destitute, etc taking into account particularly the SDGs of 1 &amp; 2.</p> <p>Present activities of influencing government agencies to ensure benefits/entitlements to deserving families/individuals may be strengthened and sustained.</p> <p>Government institutions, particularly at the local level, may be influenced to improve governance – transparency, accountability, responsiveness, equity, efficiency, effectiveness and participation - to ensure inclusion of the weaker sections in development.</p>	<p>economic and social development of the women headed families. These good initiatives have been shared with the Panchayat and other local governance from time to time. These learning would be further reinstated during the final consultation with the Government Departments and the sustainability mechanism within the community in the months of January – February 2019.</p>	<p>up during the months of January – February 2019.</p>
<p><b>8.2.2.5.1. Rights of Women Fish vendors</b></p> <p>Local government agencies may be influenced to improve the working conditions of women fish vendors in the markets – with basic facilities (toilets, water, resting rooms, lights, protection against sun and rains, and comfortable and safe places to sale counters).</p>	<p>Once the Panchayat elections are conducted and new officials elected, the three organizations will advocate with the local governance along with the support of community leaders and other stakeholders for the better working conditions of the women fish vendors. The dialogues will start in January 2019.</p>	<p>Community workers and animators with the support and guidance of the Project Coordinator. This will be an ongoing process and is expected to continue even after the completion of the project.</p>
<p><b>8.2.6 Child Rights</b></p> <p>Sustainability of ongoing activities focusing on child rights – eco-rights, rights to food/water, rights for safe and clean environment, rights to education, and inclusion of weaker children including girls - may be formulated in consultation with the concerned local institutions</p>	<p>Nearly 75 active youth group members will continue the child rights education in their school and in the communities. There has been many trainings on child rights and child protection &amp; development given to the key stakeholders in the community and it has brought about a substantial improvement in the level of knowledge and attitude of the community members. This will enable the communities to be child friendly and ensure</p>	<p>The staff team of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust</p>



<p>(schools, child action centres, Parish Committees and SHGs of women).</p> <p>Government agencies may be influenced to support activities related to child rights – including support in filling identified gaps (policies, programs) and up scaling the present activities.</p>	<p>child rights even after the completion of the project.</p>	
<p><b>8.2.7. Improve Education of School Children</b></p> <p>Sustainability of the supplementary education provided to school children from destitute families – to improve their performance and reduce dropouts – may be formulated.</p>	<p>Many young volunteers have already been involved in the supporting of the first generation learners in the supplementary education centres. The young volunteers will continue their support for the children who need academic support. Apart from this local short-term support, the three organizations will also advocate with the Government to effectively implement the Right to Education in all the government and private schools in the District.</p>	<p>The staff team of HEAL, LIFT and CARE Trust. The advocacy on the implementation of the right to education act is an ongoing process.</p>
<p><b>8.2.8. Child Development – Child Activity Centres (CACs)</b></p> <p>Sustainability of the CACs (institutional, financial, technical) may be formulated at the earliest (as discontinuation of activities may be counter-productive - children may feel abandoned, excluded, helpless), in consultation with the local institutions.</p>	<p>The Child Activity Centre activities will continued in the schools with the support of the teachers and school authorities and the youth. The youth who are now facilitating the centres have promised to continue the facilitation support even after the completion of the project.</p>	<p>The Ongoing process will continue even after the completion of the project period.</p>
<p><b>8.2.9. Awareness of Children/Youth on Environmental Issues</b></p> <p>Sustainability of ongoing activities on addressing environmental issues may be formulated.</p> <p>Disaster Prevention and Management should be included as an important topic/activity – in the light of the</p>	<p>The child rights groups, eco clubs and the youth groups are strong in the project areas and will continue after the project period with a minimal hand holding support from the teachers and community workers who are residents of the community. As a commitment to the continuation to the functioning of youth / children group the staff team members and the senior youth continue to sensitize the children and youth on environmental issues during weekends and in the evenings after school hours. The senior eco club students as well as</p>	<p>Community workers and animators with the support of the project coordinator holds the responsibility of continuing the awareness on environmental issue. This will be an ongoing work.</p>

	<p>recent Okhi cyclone, draughts, floods and other signs of climate change.</p>	<p>those children who had excelled in the environment education will continue the eco club discussions in schools.</p> <p>The youth leaders will be trained in disaster prevention and management before the end of the project (first week of February 2019).</p>	<p>Capacity building in Disaster Prevention and Management to be held in first week of February 2019.</p>
	<p><b>8.2.10. Collaboration with Government and Other Agencies</b></p> <p>Present efforts to positively and constructively influence government agencies may be strengthened with (1) evidence-based advocacy (sharing with lessons, experiences, documents); (2) identifying the appropriate agencies/levels/officials for interactions; and (3) availing the support/collaboration of other NGOs/networks.</p> <p>Experiences – good practices - and lessons of the Project may be identified, studied and documented and shared with Government and Non-Government institutions (including academic institutions) to influence policies and programs.</p>	<p>A good rapport with District Administration and line departments had been built during the project period and the follow up on advocacy work would be continued. The suggestions of the evaluation are very well taken.</p> <p>HEAL organization is part of 10 committees formed by the government and the staff members of HEAL have been participating in the committee meetings and representing the community issues to bring about a policy level change.</p> <p>The project had also helped to collaborate with the Department of Fisheries, Tamil Nadu Government and the Ministry of Tourism, Government of India.</p> <p>Experiences will be documented and shared.</p>	<p>The collaboration with the Government and other agencies is expected to continue even after the completion of project period and the directors of the three organizations would be taking up the responsibility.</p>
	<p><b>8.2.11. Joint Networking of NGO Partners with Other Agencies</b></p> <p>Partner NGOs may explore areas on which their collective networking would be more effective.</p>	<p>HEAL is also a part of 5 Networks of Civil Society Organizations at the state and national level. This has enabled to strengthen the support and take up more collaborative efforts in terms of addressing child rights and environmental issues in the region. At present, the organizations are working to advocate for the implementation of child protection policy in all the schools in Tamil Nadu through a collective of civil society organizations at the State level. Further network involvement will be assessed.</p>	<p>The Directors of all three organizations will take the responsibility even after the completion of the project period.</p>

<p><b>8.2.12 Capacity Building of Partner NGOs</b></p> <p>Partner NGOs may be supported to monitor, evaluate and document the impacts of the Project.</p> <p>Partner NGOs may be supported to study and document the important processes, experiences and lessons (Good Practices, Key Lessons) of the Project for own learning and sharing/advocacy with others.</p> <p>Partner NGOs may be supported to formulate appropriate strategies to sustain (and possibly upscale the programs with suitable changes) in consultation with the target groups.</p>	<p>The capacity building training on monitoring, evaluation and impact documentation for the staff team to be held by January 2019 by the specialist documentation.</p> <p>The study on good practices will be done under the theme of each objective of the project and the experience of all three organization will be documented and shared.</p>	<p>The good practices document to be completed by the specialist documentation in February 2019.</p>
---	--	--